Analysis of Effect of Supervisors’ Behavior on Subordinates’ Job Satisfaction

1Maria Mehboob, 2Imtiaz Arif and 3Mudassir Jalal

1Business Graduate, Iqra University, Abid Town, Block-2 Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Karachi, Pakistan.
2Asst. Professor, Iqra University, Abid Town, Block-2 Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Karachi, Pakistan.
3Asst. Professor, Iqra University, Abid Town, Block-2 Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Karachi, Pakistan.

Abstract: There are numbers of factors that affects the satisfaction level of employees of an organization. Researchers have studied the variables like working conditions, work place environment, role of Perks and benefits, role of training and development etc and their impact on job satisfaction of employees. This study has been done to analyze the impact of Supervisor’s behavior on subordinate’s job satisfaction. For study, the sample has been selected from private universities of Karachi and the questionnaires have been filled by both teaching and non teaching staff. 120 respondents (both male and females) participated and filled the questionnaire. Multiple regression analysis has been run for analysis of data and formulation of possible relation of dependent and independent variables. Five attributes of Supervisors’ behavior are identified from literature review namely Value congruity, Perceptual discrepancy, Supportive behavior, Similar personalities and trustworthiness. It has been found from data analysis that Perceptual discrepancy, supportive behavior and similar personalities do have a significant relation with the job satisfaction. The remaining two variables do not have a significant impact on job satisfaction of subordinates.

Key words:

Background:

Interactions and connections among the co-workers and employees of an organization are of great importance. Since they have an influence on the overall performance of the organization and the Organizational goals are being affected by them. These relations and interactions may affect many job related factors like efficiency, effectiveness, performance, satisfaction etc.

Though the relationship between employees is of great importance similarly the relation of a supervisor or manager and his/her subordinate or employee affects the performance of the employee. The trust of the supervisor and his/her behavior towards the employees leaves an impact on performance and attitude of employee towards the job (Valerius & Laura, 1998).

Usually the concern of business critics has been the analysis of how to make employees work harder, increase their sense of citizenship and other roles that employees play in an organization. But little concern is shown about what role managers should play to motivate their employees. The employees appear to be highly motivated by behavior of managers and management’s concern for them. Attitude of manager towards his/her subordinate is likely to affect the job satisfaction.

According to social exchange theory, resources have been allocated to the subordinates by their supervisors based on the work done by the subordinates. In exchange, services are provided by the subordinates for enhancement of the productivity of the organization. A supervisor is likely to trust a subordinate when he/she has confidence in that subordinate to successfully perform a task at the same time as minimizing the risks of employees operating with self-interest at the cost of organizational goals. Thus it can be said that supervisors’ attitude toward subordinate is also influenced by subordinate’s reciprocated behavior. Supervisors generally trust those who have the ability to carry out tasks as requested by them where as subordinates are likely to give trust when communication issues surrounding interactional justice in regards to reward allocations (Werbel & Henriques, 2009).

Contextual Framework:

The relationship between a supervisor and his/her subordinates influences the Job performance and Job satisfaction of the subordinates. Different elements of behavior of a supervisor towards his/her employee strengthen or weaken the relation between them which results in Job satisfaction or dissatisfaction. Amongst various factors affecting Job satisfaction of employees, the behavior of supervisor towards his/her subordinate is the concern of this research.

The research has been conducted in the service sector of Pakistan, where the primary focus is on Educational institutes particularly universities. The research is limited to the flatter organizations where supervisor and subordinates have direct interactions. Both teaching and non-teaching staff have been interviewed.

Corresponding Author: Maria Mehboob, Business Graduate, Iqra University, Abid Town, Block-2 Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Karachi, Pakistan
Tel: +92214800670-4 Fax: +92214987806
2984
Statement of the Problem:
This research is designed to investigate how the behavioral elements of a Supervisor influences the behavior of his/her subordinates to remain satisfied or dissatisfied from the Job. For the purpose different elements of Supervisor’s personality, behavior and attitude have been considered and their effect on employee job satisfaction has been studies.

Purpose of the Study:
Purpose of this study is to identify the impact of Supervisors’ behavioral elements that strengthens/weakens their relation with the subordinates resulting in job satisfaction or dissatisfaction. This research is focused on Educational institutes of Karachi (Pakistan), particularly the private universities.

Questions and Hypotheses:
Human Behavior has various aspects therefore to analyze its impacts, one needs to carry out an indepth study to explore each of its variable. Since this study is focussed on analysis of Supervisor’s behavior therefore we have identified 5 important variables/aspects of behavior which if possessed by a supervisor, may result in satisfaction or dissatisfaction of subordinate. The literature from which these variables are extracted, are discussed in the literature review part. Variables that are studied are Value congruency, perceptual discrepency, supportive behavior, similar personality and trustwothiness.

The problem has been investigated with the help of the following research questions:
1) What are the elements of supervisors’ behavior that affects subordinates’ job satisfaction in educational institutes of Karachi?
2) How Supervisor-subordinate relationship affects the Job satisfaction of subordinate in educational institutes of Karachi?

Hypotheses:
H1: Behavioral element; Value congruency, of supervisor influences the job satisfaction of subordinates.
H2: Behavioral element; Perceptual discrepency, of supervisor influences the job satisfaction of subordinates.
H3: Behavioral element; Supportive behavior, of supervisor influences the job satisfaction of subordinates.
H4: Behavioral element; Similar personality, of supervisor influences the job satisfaction of subordinates.
H5: Behavioral element; Trustworthiness, of supervisor influences the job satisfaction of subordinates.

Limitations:
There are several limitations that have been faced.
- The sample is selected only from Karachi that have been used to generalize result about a larger population.
- The research is limited to flat organizations.
- The participants who filled up the questionnaire were reluctant to provide the correct information related to their supervisors. Although several efforts were made to gain their confidence that the provided information will be kept anonymously and confidentially but hardly they agreed to provide the sufficient information.
- Being a student, the time constraints were faced and there was lack of financial resources required to conduct the research.

Significance Of The Study:
This research is designed to fill the gap of studies conducted in Pakistani scenario. It will help the managers in understanding how they can retain their employees by increasing the level of their job satisfaction. Supervisors will be able to mold their behaviors as desired by their employees. They will be able to understand that employees’ dedication and motivation is not just dependent on compensation packages but also it is dependent on their relationship with their supervisors. This study will make it clear that what role supervisors play in making the employees satisfied from their jobs.

Literature Review:
Theoretical Background:
Job satisfaction can be defined in number of ways, (Abdulla, Djobarni, & Mellahi, 2010) states that “it is the degree to which a job is liked by its performer”. There are many factors that affect the job satisfaction of employees like Environmental factors, demographic factors etc. Environmental factors represent the immediate job environment that contains skills required to perform a job, authority, autonomy, relationship with supervisors and co-workers and other working conditions (Abdulla, Djobarni, & Mellahi, 2010).

Dansereau, Graen&Haga proposed Leader-Member exchange theory(the LMX Theory) in 1975 which states that in most of the situations of Leadership, each follower is treated differently by the leader developing Dyadic relationships. As a result, the followers are divided in two groups i.e. In-group and Out-group.
**In-Group:**
This group is comprised of lesser number of employees and members whom the leader trusts. Members of this group receive special attention due to their honesty and loyalty. They often perform tasks other than defined job descriptions by voluntarily rendering their services. As a consequence, the supervisors give them benefits in different forms.

**Out-Group:**
Members of this group have formal interaction with the leader. They are considered to be less motivated since they perform the tasks assigned to them in job descriptions only. As a consequence, they receive less benefit and are found in unknown zone to the leader.

The characteristics of members leave perception in mind of the leader which led him/her to consider them as part of either In-group or Out-group. An ideal situation is the one where the leader treats his/her whole organizational members as part of In-group (Babou, 2008).

While studying the Science of Organizations, the most attracting area of study for researchers has been the identification of factors that forces the employees to perform well on the job and remain satisfied with their jobs. Up till now major research work has been carried out in analyzing individual task performance and task settings. But little work is done in finding how individual interpret interpersonal context for achieving situations and in this regard how they are influenced by goal orientations.

The way a employee maintains relationships with his colleagues and supervisors have been studied. LMX theory discusses the relationship that each employee establishes with his manager or supervisor. This relationship is found to be affecting Employee’s job performance directly (Janssen & Yperen, 2004).

Trust held with superior results in job satisfaction, performance, loyalty, honesty, dedication and innovative attitude. Trust helps the supervisors in achieving desired goals and objectives of organization by promoting positive relationships at work. Superior’s influence is found to bring positive attitude in employees, organizational commitment, better performance and job satisfaction (Goris, Vaught, & Pettit Jr., 2003).

Many researchers have conducted researches discussing the leader-member and supervisor-subordinate relationship. In the following section, firstly researches related to supervisors’ behavior have been discussed. Then the theories and researches related to Supervisor-subordinate relationship have been discussed. Then the role of supervisor in employee’s job satisfaction has been discussed in light of previous researches.

**Empirical Studies:**

**Supervisors’ Behavior and its Effect:**
It’s usually believed that supervisors have a lot of influence on organizations they lead. Replacement of coaches when teams do not perform well, in business press on hearing CEO transition news the financial analysts recommend stock purchasing - gives the supporting evidence to the statement.

Low level of supervisor conscientiousness along with high level of supervisor trust, kindness, agreeableness, extraversion and emotional stability are directly related to employee job satisfaction, job commitment, satisfaction with supervisor, innovative attitude and turnover intentions (Smith & Canger, 2004).

Lester et al (2010) studied the behavior of desktop managers (who spend most of their time by keeping themselves engaged with the computer) and its effects on organizations. They discussed that over time the behavioral categories of management (i.e. Planning, organizing, leading, coordinating and controlling) being identified by Fayol have been shortened. Mintzberg (1973) identified three role categories which are interpersonal, informational and decisional roles. In this research it had been identified that to manage knowledge workers a manager is required to possess interpersonal skills with the ability to communicate with subordinates since knowledge workers look for timely communication with their supervisors. But unfortunately organizations are found to promote technically-skilled workers who lack in interpersonal skills and behavioral attributes. These desktop managers are although efficient and possess the ability to find information on any topic on the internet but they lack the ability to manage the organization’s greatest resource, its people. This results in decreasing job satisfaction of subordinates. For the research, survey was conducted in 30 organizations of USA. Four variables (Job satisfaction, Organizational commitment, Organizational citizenship behavior and Zest-enthusiasm-vitality) were studied and Factors Analysis had been applied.

Knoll and Gill (2011) studied the development of workplace trust in upward, downward, and lateral relationships and examined the relative importance of capability, integrity and benevolence in predicting trust in supervisor, subordinate, and peer. Sample of 187 HR professionals responded to the online survey and T-test was applied on the 16 variables. They discussed that perceived benevolence is the perception that the trustee will act in the best interests of the trustor. Findings suggested that according to the trustor-trustee dyad, in predicting trust, the relative importance of capability, integrity and benevolence differed. This research suggested that trust in downward relationships i.e. subordinates effects employee job outcomes To gain trust of subordinates, the managers may facilitate it through employee development and succession planning.
strategies to make sure that available vacancies and positions are filled through internal recruitment and opportunity is given to the most qualified individuals.

Hsu, et al (2010) studied the supportive behavior of a supervisor towards work-family conflict of its subordinates resulting in job satisfaction/dissatisfaction. This research investigated and found that supervisor with a higher level of LMX and expressive ties to their subordinates generally offers higher level of supervisory support. On the other hand leaders with higher level of instrumental ties to their subordinates tend to offer lower levels of support. It is studied that job roles pressure is related to work-family conflict that can be reduced through social support. For the research 244 valid questionnaires were gathered from workers in industries in Taiwan and China and multiple regression analyses were used for data analysis. Thus it is found that supportive behavior of leaders may have serious impact on job satisfaction of employees if they are supported for work-family conflict.

G. Devos et al (2007) investigated in their research that which individual, organizational and external environment factors act as contributing factors for understanding well-being of Principals of Flemish primary school. They discussed that according to the Attraction-Selection-Attrition theory employees prefer those work environment which they find most instrumental for attainment of their valued outcomes. Employees are mostly attracted by those organizations which have value congruency with their own personal values.

In Susan DelVecchio (1996) research, social exchange theory argues that imbalances occurring in vertical dyad (subordinate-superior) may affect job-related outcomes such as performance, satisfaction etc. If the supervisor-subordinate association is described in terms of exchanges, then comparing each member’s perceptions of what has been exchanged should be revealed. Since if these perceptions do not agree, the relationships of supervisor-subordinate will suffer. As a job-related outcome, the satisfaction level is affected by incongruent supervisor-subordinate perceptions.

Nicholas Dimarco (1975) has indicated that supervisor-subordinate similarity in terms of biographical and personality attributes, is found to be linked with increased job satisfaction of subordinate. He examined the combatibility between life style of supervisor and subordinates and its implications on satisfaction of subordinates. It was concluded that supervisor should be assigned to a workgroup that is based on degree of compatibility between subordinates’ personality and his own personality.

With above discussed literature, the following dimensions of Supervisors’ behaviour have been identified. This research is confined to these variables only. The importance of each of them has been discussed one by one. Their impact on subordinates’ job satisfaction has been examined.

- **Value Congruity:**
  The discussion of job satisfaction and values indicates that usually employees desire to work with those leaders and supervisors who make them available with several opportunities during their job to attain important values such as achievement, innovation etc. As value-congruity between supervisor and subordinate enables them to have same point of view, the subordinate feels comfortable and satisfied with his supervisor behavior and job as a whole (Kemelgor, 1982).
  Value-congruity affects the relationship of supervisor and subordinate. Employees having value structures somewhat similar to their supervisors are found to be highly satisfied with their jobs. Also value-system relationship affects employee job satisfaction significantly, where Value is defined as “a hierarchy of fundamental interacting life directions that act as the criteria for psychological behavior”. It is suggested that similarity of values improves communication, demolish conflicts, promotes cooperation, higher morale and thus results in individual’s satisfaction (Kemelgor, 1982).

- **Perceptual Discrepancy:**
  When supervisor and subordinate have different perception of job requirement, the expected result of this discrepancy is likelihood that subordinate quits. Perceptual discrepancy’s path leads to job dissatisfaction resulting increased turnover intension of subordinate. The findings show that although their were minor disparity between the perception of supervisor and subordinate related to Job perception even then it resulted in job dissatisfaction of subordinate and in some cases it converted as turnover intension. To decrease this practice it is therefore suggested that supervisors should promote open environment where subordinate may feel free to reveal their ideas and perceptions. This practice will decrease the likelihood of occurrence of the discrepancy between the perceptions of supervisor and subordinate (Chiu, Lai, & Snape, 1996).

- **Similar Personality:**
  Kamarul Zaman Bin Ahmad, in his research, discussed that subordinates are found to be satisfied with the jobs and supervision when the supervisors’ personality becomes similar to their personalities. It is suggested that companies striving for better supervisor-subordinate relationship should make sure employees are not assigned to managers having different personalities. This will be advantageous in the companies where supervisors need
to keep an eye on workers most of the time. Where as, in organizations where supervisors are required to give
instructions only-similar personalities are not much beneficial (Ahmad, 2008).
Mastery orientation of employees comprises believe of performing the best, enhancing the skills, being
honest, being innovative and being competent. Performance orientation of employees demonstrates that one
wants superiority over others. In the research it was investigated that mastery orientation helps in establishing
high quality exchange relationship between supervisor and subordinate where performance orientation acts the
opposite. It is found that mastery orientation leads to job satisfaction and innovation and this relationship is
extended due to quality of leader-member exchange and supervisors are found to have better social relations
with these goal oriented employees (Janssen & Yperen, 2004).

- **Trustworthiness:**
  Trust in supervisors and influence of supervisors-predictors of job performance and job satisfaction of
subordinates. They help in achieving Organizational goals and enforcing positive relationships at work. Trust in
superior is directly related to the subordinate’s job satisfaction, commitment and honesty. And positive
influence of supervisor also helps in obtaining the same results with learning attitude of employees and
commendable performance. Variable for the research conducted are growth need strength, trust in superiors,
influence of superiors, scope, performance and satisfaction. The finding showed that trust and influence of
superiors have a positive relation with Job satisfaction (Goris, Vaught, & Pettit Jr., 2003).

- **Supportive Behavior:**
  It is investigated in research how variables such as Supervisor support, stress, perceived stressors etc
influence the intention of an employee to quit job by dissatisfying him. Lack of job satisfaction and Job stressors
leads an employee to quit his job. It is found that support of supervisor is a factor that reduces the impact of job
stressors, reduces stress; increases job satisfaction, organizational commitment and thus lead to reduction of
turnover intention. Impact of Job stressors can be reduced in number of ways such as dividing the workload
equally, making the job related tasks more clear and achievable (Firth, Mellor, Moore, & Loquet, 2004).

Leadership behavior and job satisfaction have been studied in almost every field including hospitals,
educational institutes, and other large and small firms. Supporting results have proven the existence of
relationship between them but nature of this relationship is controversial and the answer varies that relationship
is positive or negative. It is due to different leadership behaviors (Bartolo & Furlonger, 2000)

**Research Purpose:**
The purpose of this study is to observe the supervisors’ behavioral elements being identified in the literature
review. Their impact on Job satisfaction of subordinates has been the observed in this research. This is to fill
the research gap in the Pakistan scenario particularly in field of human resource management of Educational
sector.

**Research Approach:**
The deductive approach proceeds by forming a specific concept from a generic idea. In general terminology
it is also called a “top-down” approach (Burney, 2008). The deductive approach has been used since it is known
theoretically that supervisors-subordinate good relations results in job satisfaction. On basis of this theoretical
knowledge, hypothesis is designed. After collection of data and analysing it, the findings have been contrasted
with the existing theory.

Positivist epistemology is concerned since the topic is from social sciences but natural science methodology
has been used. In research design, cross-sectional design i.e. survey is selected that has been conducted in
educational institutes of Karachi.

**Research Design:**
Quantitative research method has been followed in this study because statistical tools are helpful in
evaluating the information collected from large sample. Questionnaires that are being filled by teaching and
non-teaching staff i.e. subordinates only and through likert scaling the data has been quantified. Multiple regression Analysis is run to find the impact of independent variables on dependent variable.Where

- **Dependent Variable is Job Satisfaction**
- **Independent Variables are behavioral elements of supervisor**
  - Value Congruity
  - Perceptual Discrepancy
  - Similar Personality
  - Trustworthiness
  - Supportive Behavior
Population:
The population of this research is comprised of all teaching and non-teaching staff in higher educational institutes of Pakistan. As the aim of this research is to study the impacts in Pakistani scenario therefore all educational institutes’ managers and employees are considered to be part of population. All the private universities make the population.

Sampling:
Sampling is done through simple random sampling. But sample has been selected only from educational institutes in Karachi. It is assumed that there are minor cultural differences in organizations in different cities of Pakistan so sample selected from Karachi institutes are internally and externally valid. From the rest of the universities, selected universities are Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science and Technology (Szabist), Institute of Business Management (CBM), Preston University, PAF-KIET University, Biztek Institute of business and technology, IQRA University Gulshan campus and Iqra University North Campus. The questionnaires are being filled by total 120 staff members (teaching and non-teaching) of these institutes.

Data Collection Techniques:
For data collection, survey method has been selected. The instrument i.e. questionnaire has been filled by subordinates only i.e. to study supervisors behavior, teaching and non-teaching staff of different universities have been asked to fill the questionnaires. Different educational institutes of Karachi, particularly universities, are visited for collection of data.

Data Analysis Technique:
With help of Lickert scale, the qualitative data has been quantified. Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version15 has been used. The data has been analysed to check the hypotheses and built possible relationship between dependent and independent variables. Multiple regression has been applied since the research is designed to study the impact of five identified independent variables on one dependent variable.

Instrumentation:
Questionnaire is used that is obtained from a previous study. It is developed by (Tate, Whatley, & Clugston, 1997) for their study of three nations. For each factor of the scale, internal reliability is reported to be (α=0.61 to 0.91). Few modifications are being done and for re-checking of internal validity, pilot test has been used. Few more questions are added from LBDQ (Leader Behavior Description Questionnaire) to explore the desired aspects of supervisor’s behavior. Fact that should be kept in mind about this questionnaire is, this instrument measures a leader’s behavior structure and consideration by asking the subordinate to describe the behavior of their leader (Durand & Nord, 1976).

Scaling:
The five scaled likert scale has been set from Always to Never scaling as A for Always, B for Often, C for Occasionally, D for Rarely and E for Never. The independent and dependent variables have been evaluated on the basis of this scaling.

Reliability:
The analysis of the data is initiated with the determination of instrument’s internal consistency. This was found through application of reliability test i.e. Cronbach’s alpha coefficient. The scale’s reliability was determined through sample of 120 respondents each of them answered 25 questions.

Pilot Testing:
In order to determine appropriate question content, response time, and statistical analysis, a pilot study (n=30) was conducted with participants outside the original study but having the same characteristics of the study sample. This pilot study included a convenience sample that was based on availability. There were thirty respondents to the pilot test, which represented a 25 percent response rate. A Cronbach’s alpha coefficient was computed to determine the internal consistency (reliability) of the instrument. The coefficient for the twenty-five items in the pilot study was .861. This is considerably above the recommended .70 (Nunnaly, 1970).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cronbach's Alpha</th>
<th>N of Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.861</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The reliability test of the data reveals that the data set entered in the analysis is reliable, and further tests can be applied on the data to conclude the results.
Descriptive Statistics:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JS</td>
<td>3.3017</td>
<td>.74968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>3.3813</td>
<td>.72033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PD</td>
<td>3.3292</td>
<td>.74824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB</td>
<td>3.4229</td>
<td>.90737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td>3.5188</td>
<td>.96861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TW</td>
<td>3.5708</td>
<td>.99483</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In total there were 120 respondents. The average rating for ‘JS’ by the respondents was 3.3, which shows that average JS or Job Satisfaction as important factor. Similarly, average rating for ‘VC’ was 3.38, which indicates that average number of the respondents consider it as a critical factor. As far as ‘PD’ is concerned the average rating was 3.32, which shows that average number of the respondents do consider it as an important factor. Likewise, average rating for ‘SB’ was 3.51, which reveals that average respondents do consider it as a vital aspect. As far as ‘TW’ are concerned, most of the respondents rated it 3.57, which shows that average respondents do consider it as a key factor with respect to our model.

Multiple Regression Analysis:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Coefficients</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>VIF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>1.721</td>
<td>4.859</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>-.112</td>
<td>-1.402</td>
<td>.164</td>
<td>1.166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PD</td>
<td>.259</td>
<td>3.122</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>1.350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SB</td>
<td>-.250</td>
<td>-3.085</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>1.902</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td>.426</td>
<td>4.903</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2.491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TW</td>
<td>.127</td>
<td>1.703</td>
<td>.091</td>
<td>1.942</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted R Square</td>
<td>.397</td>
<td>16.686</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table reveals that all the proposed factors account for 39.7% affect on Job satisfaction of the employee. VIF shows the multicollinearity concern in the model. The value of none of the variables is more than 5, which shows that there is no concern of multicollinearity in our model. Predictors are not interrelated and correlated.

It is clear from the results that three out of five proposed factors significantly affect the Job satisfaction of the employee in the surveyed universities. VC i.e. Value congruity has the significance value of 0.164 which is higher than 0.05. This shows that Value Congruity is insignificant variable in our proposed model. The possible reason may be explained as the employee value their personal welfare over the organization welfare where as supervisors want them to give priority to the professional life. Therefore this discrepancy leaves a negative impact on the job satisfaction of subordinates.

The other insignificant variable in the proposed model is Trustworthiness which has a significant value of 0.091 which is greater than 0.05. It was found through questionnaires, filled by different staff members, that existence of trustworthiness does not guarantees the job satisfaction of subordinates. Since in working environment of Pakistani educational institutes, the supervisors are although trustworthy but due to other typical working conditions this trustworthy behavior does not result in job satisfaction of subordinates. Another issue is of procrastination. Supervisors trust their subordinates that if they assign them a task then it will be done on time that is in few matters they trust their subordinates and delegate them some particular tasks. Subordinates sometimes take it easy and fail to meet the deadline due to backward scheduling which result in some serious reaction of supervisor. So trust in the relation either doesn’t affects the job satisfaction directly or results in job dissatisfaction of subordinate.

The variables that have a significant relation with job satisfaction are PD, SB and PS i.e. perceptual discrepancy, supportive behavior and personality similarities respectively.

The model from the calculated beta values can be stated as

\[ JS= 1.721+(-0.112)VC+(0.259)PD+(-0.250)SB+(0.426)PS+(0.127)TW \]

The most influential factor is PS which has the beta value of .426, which makes it as the most persuasive factor on Job satisfaction of the employee in the surveyed universities. Moreover, the above table reveals that the second influential variable is PD which has the beta value of .259 which makes it the second most influential variable in our model. This shows that Job satisfaction of the employee in a given firm is greatly affected by Perceptual Discrepancy. On the other hand, the third most influential variable is Trust Worthiness which has the beta value of .127, which reveals that this factor also positively influences Job satisfaction of the subordinate in the private universities to a great extent. In this way we can say that Perceptual Discrepancy, Trust Worthiness,
and Personality Similarities are those attributes of supervisor’s behavior that influence the Job satisfaction of the subordinates in private universities in positive manner.

Now if we look at the other side of the model i.e. the negative influencing factors, the model reveals that there are two factors in the model that influences the Job satisfaction of the subordinate in private universities in negative way. These two variables are Value congruity and Supportive behavior.

The negative relation of supportive behavior can be justified as when the supervisor is being supportive to few people among his/her subordinates the rest of the subordinates feel unjustified behavior of their supervisor towards themselves. At times they feel ignorant and of less importance and this feeling results in their job dissatisfaction. In Pakistan’s working environment this problem is generally faced by male gender subordinates, but since our research has not been conducted in a way that we could bifurcate the findings on gender basis therefore it has been suggested for future studies that this aspect should be explored.

In this way the hypothesis H1 and H5 have been rejected and it has been concluded that in private universities of Pakistan, Supervisors’ behavioral attribute; Value congruity and Trustworthiness, do not affect the job satisfaction of teaching and non-teaching staff members. Whereas it can be concluded from acceptance of H2, H3 and H4, that Perceptual discrepancy, supportive behavior and similar personalities do affect the job satisfaction of subordinates (teaching and non-teaching staff of private universities).

**Conclusion:**

With this chapter we will conclude and summarize the results of the data collected, analyzed and its interpretation. The results drawn from hypotheses testing is interpreted, and with the help of the analysis the answer of the research questions identified in early chapter will be summarized. Discussion, managerial implications and areas for further research have been suggested in this section.

**Discussion and Managerial Implications:**

Before interpreting the findings of the research, the limitations should be explained first. Most importantly it has to be kept in mind that these relationships have been studied in particular kind of organization which are private universities in Karachi, Pakistan. Secondly the entire LBDQ model was not used but instead relevant questions were taken. Data based on only the subscales may not be psychometrically equivalent to data collected when entire instrument is used (Durand & Nord, 1976).

In typical Pakistani scenario most of the organizations have pure bureaucratic environment. But in the private institutes it has been observed that concept of flatter organization has been promoted where there are functional groups working under supervision of a leader. Thus for them, along with other working conditions the behavior and attitude of their supervisor is an important factor that affects their satisfaction level towards the job. For our study we selected the educational institutions particularly private universities to study the impact of supervisor’s behavior on the subordinates’ job satisfaction.

From literature review part five independent variables had been identified namely Value congruity, Perceptual discrepancy, Supportive Behavior, Similar personalities and trustworthiness. Questionnaire had been designed for data collection from different universities and then multiple regression analysis has been applied to identify and formulate the possible relation between Dependent and independent variables.

In Pakistani scenario it has been believed that “Boss is always right” therefore if when we tried to find the possible implications of concept of value-congruity, an insignificant relation between VC and job satisfaction was found. The underlying reason may be that, subordinates are appreciated when they value the things that have been valued by their supervisors but in the case of vice versa, they rarely find the supervisors that would help them in attaining their valued things in life. Thus there was an insignificant relation found between job satisfaction and value congruity.

In case of perceptual discrepancy, there is a significant relation between PD and job satisfaction. When it is about a particular task, its priority level and the way it is supposed to be done, understanding of both the things is very important. When the supervisor and subordinates have the same perceptions, it strengthens their relation resulting in job satisfaction of the subordinate.

Similar personality and supportive behavior has a significant relation with job satisfaction. In case of supportive behavior, it is having negatively significant relation with job satisfaction. The reason may be defined as since we have discussed the groups’ relation with the leader, when leader supports an individual within a group then rest of the members feels partially neglected and level of the job satisfaction decreases.

It is found from data analysis that there has been an insignificant relation between trustworthiness and job satisfaction of subordinate. This finding was surprising since from the past studies it had been suggested that there is a significant relation between trust in supervisor and subordinate and job satisfaction (Knoll & Gill, 2011). The possible reasoning behind this finding might be the change in work place environment where the research has been conducted. It may be suggested that in private universities of Karachi, existence of trust in supervisor-subordinate relation doesn’t guarantees the job satisfaction of subordinate. Possible reason is that this research has been conducted to analyze the relation of supervisor with individual member of the group as well.
as with the whole group. When it is about the group, if supervisor trusts only particular member of the group
then rest of the members may feel under estimated and this would result in dissatisfaction.

For managerial implications it may be suggested that managers, when dealing with individual employee or
with whole group, should concentrate on their behavioral attributes since their behavior and attitude directly and
indirectly affects the satisfaction level of the subordinates. In particular the HR department should place the
people of same personality and behavior in the same group in flatter organisations. Where as for supportive
behavior it should be crossed checked by the higher management that all the employees have been equally
treated and the distribution of perks and benefits should be performance based and biasnesses should be avoid.
Lastly, to avoid perceptual discrepancy the managers should well define the tasks and targets and also the means
through which the targets are meant to be achieved.

**Recommendations for Future Research:**

Job satisfaction has always been an issue across the world and various researches have been conducted in this
area. It has been observed that not much research work has been conducted in Pakistan particularly in the
private sector. To access the job satisfaction and to accelerate it, it is required that researches should be
conducted in this area particularly in Pakistani scenario. The cultural changes do not let the other researches that
have been carried out in other countries, to be applied to Pakistani scenario therefore it is a must to carry out the
research work particularly for the issues being faced by Pakistan based organizations.

The previous researches have been carried out to analyze how to make an employee more productive and
how to increase profits. But it has been recommended that more work should be done on employees job
satisfaction since in today's dynamic and competitive era it is very important to retain the capable employees
and keep them motivated. Therefore a supervisor/leader must know what role he can play in order to keep his
subordinate motivated and loyal towards the job.

We have selected five attributes of supervisor's behavior where as there are number of other facets that
need to be analysed. Also we have limited our research to Private universities of Karachi only, the same work
may be done for other firms as well in the other areas as well.

It is also suggested that only those people should be made a part of research who are able to provide honest
answers. In bureaucratic organizations of Pakistan, it is difficult to carry out the same study therefore in future
the researchers may remain cautious while selecting the organization.

**REFERENCES**

Dubai police, 40(1): 126-146.

Ahmad, K., 2008. Relationship between leader-subordinate personality congruence and performance and


Chiu, C., G. Lai, E. Snape, 1996. Differences in Job perception- What happens when supervisor and

DelVecchio, S., 1996. Differences in salesperson and manager perceived control: a comparison of dyadic


Dimarco, N., 1975. Style, Work Group Structure, Compatibility and Job Satisfaction. The Academy of

Durand, D., W. Nord, 1976. Perceived Leader Behavior as a Function of Personality Characteristics of

Firth, L., D. Mellor, K. Moore, C. Loquet, 2004. How can managers reduce employee intention to quit?

Goris, J., B. Vaught, Jr., J. Pettit, 2003. Effects of trust in superiors and influence of superiors on the
association between Individual-job congruence and Job performance/satisfaction. Business and psychology.


Janssen, O., N. Yperen, 2004. Employees' goal orientations, the quality of leader-member exchange and the

Kemelgor, B., 1982. Job satisfaction as mediated by the value congruity of supervisors and their


